



Sedona Fire District

2860 Southwest Drive, Sedona, Arizona 86336
Telephone (928) 282-6800 FAX (928) 282-6857

9/11 MEMORIAL COMMITTEE MEETING Station #6 – Chapel Area – Sedona – Conference Room Wednesday, May 4, 2016 / 9:00 AM

~ MINUTES ~

I. CALL TO ORDER/ROLL CALL

Committee Members: Chairman Scott Jablow; Dennis Burke; David Soto; Wendy Tanzer; Tricia Greer
Others Present: Assistant Chief Jeff Piechura

Committee Chairman Scott Jablow opened the meeting at 9:10 AM.

II. Discussion/Possible Action: Review Submitted Bids for the Station #6 9/11 Memorial Plaza Construction Project and Consider Recommendation for SFD Governing Board.

Mr. Soto said 3 contractors submitted bids to construct the Memorial (see table below):

Name	Bid Amount	Alternate 1A	Alternate 1B	Alternate 2A	Alternate 2B
FCI	\$169,000.00	\$13,931.00	\$2,792.00	\$8,185.00	\$2,220.00
DeTar	\$65,611.64	\$5,775.21	\$1,279.54	\$4,946.42	\$1,279.54
Danson	\$139,000.00	\$10,500.00	\$1,000.00	\$6,600.00	\$1,000.00

Alternate 1A relocates existing lighting fixtures, 1B is for a bench on the north side, 2A is to build the south bench, and 2B is for 2 step-lights.

Mr. Jablow said he spoke to Fire Chief Kris Kazian who told him DeTar's pricing is higher because of the polished concrete, which is labor intensive, and adds about \$17,000. Mr. Jablow is concerned about the high quotes because we had asked LEA to design a Memorial for about \$35,000 to \$40,000. The committee discussed options. Chief Piechura commented the Performance Bond which penalizes contractors at \$500 per day (\$15,000 per month) has scared some contractors and added to the quotes.

Mrs. Tanzer asked about the reason for the \$100,000 difference; Chief Piechura said some of that is the distance for the contractors to come up from Phoenix. We could consider negotiating the price down – to have the architect talk to DeTar directly. Chief Piechura said we still want this to be a remarkable monument to the community, but believes there are options to get there. LEA could ask them to discuss it and come back with an alternative bid, and then, give the committee recommendation to the Board for final approval and this would not just be for DeTar, but to give all 3 contractors the opportunity.

Mr. Jablow then called LEA at 9:40 AM for a telephone conference with Larry and Lance Enyart. Mr. Jablow asked the Enyarts if they had information why the bids were so out of alignment with where we wanted them to be. Larry Enyart said per the request of the Committee, LEA has not talked with any of the bidders to understand what the challenges may have been – but he does know it is very busy right now for school construction and it is a challenging time to be bidding. Lance Enyart said in seeing the great discrepancy between the bid prices and knowing they have a hard time finding sub-contractors to bid the project because of its small size and location – it indicates the difficulty for a project of this nature. He said the good news for SFD is one of the quotes shows good value compared to the two higher bidders.

Mr. Jablow said Chief Kazian spoke to DeTar, and part of the issue was the polishing of the concrete; he asked Larry if it was necessary for the job; he replied it is not absolutely necessary, but the effect is

similar to the ground concrete floors in the station which make a very durable surface for the benches, and allows more forgiveness in mistakes in casting the concrete. When Station 6 was built, the price for ground concrete floors was \$6 to \$8 per square foot, but the quotes from Danson and FCI are 5 to 6 times that much. Many contractors do not want to do the specialized work, and have much larger projects. Mr. Jablow asked LEA if they would be open to talking to DeTar to explain the amount, as proposed, may be too high; Larry said, yes, but that one of the problems was when legal proposed adding liquidated damages at \$500 per day, sub-contractors are nervous about getting blamed, and get stuck with the costs. He is hoping staff could speak to legal to reduce or eliminate the requirement. Mr. Soto asked about the amount of time needed for the concrete to cure in time for the unveiling on 9/11/16; Lance said this is contract time of 75 days, which would allow for concrete curing time if we award the bid pretty quickly. Larry said the per square inch strength after 30 days is the ultimate, but even within a week or two, it would not be an impediment; Mr. Jablow expressed concern because of a City of Sedona project that had a pavilion collapse because of insufficient curing time. Larry replied this is not an elevated situation, and other than holding up the artifact, which is in the footing, it would be ready in time for the steel installation. Mr. Jablow said he would ask Chief Kazian to talk to Attorney Bill Whittington about changing the performance bond terminology. Mr. Soto asked about the support for the beam; Larry said there is a steel plate cast into the concrete and then the steel beam is welded to that; the anchor mechanism is in the concrete.

Mr. Soto said the total for the alternates from DeTar is \$13,200; he asked if we need them; Lance said no, and that they were added to see what the cost would be to have the polished concrete benches for the Friendship Walk, and by the fallen officer's memorial – mainly for the overall composition of the project to be integrated as part of the whole 9/11 experience. Discussion was held regarding options – such as exposed concrete, which is the material on the outside of Station 6, but it was decided to wait until LEA talks to DeTar about some of the cost concerns. Larry said he would talk to each of the 3 contractors who submitted bids. Lance commented they were very conscious of how to design lighting to illuminate the Memorial and address safety/liability concerns, but some lighting could be eliminated without compromising safety; he believes we need to keep downlights on artifact and safety lights for pathway.

Chief Piechura noted the committee does not have authority to make a decision on behalf of the district, but can direct with Chief Kazian to make sure we are following procurement State law. He understands the Committee and District are interested in further dialogue with DeTar to clarify the bid for finish work and elements of main bid package; the committee wants to talk about the pricing structure and an alternative approach to see what added changes could be, but not to negotiate an agreement yet. Mr. Jablow asked LEA to contact DeTar and find out the timeframe for a follow-up committee meeting, and let Ms. Greer know, so she can schedule a Committee meeting. Larry commented time is of the essence, and we need to move forward quickly, but he said it is not unrealistic the project could be completed in time for the 9/11/16 dedication if construction begins around June 1st. He said the liquidated damages clause caused problems and suggested, in the spirit of better pricing to drop that requirement, perhaps the contractors would be able to find subs more amicable to quote a better price. He believes DeTar Construction and its record of building quality products would be a great choice, especially since it is local; he believes the disparity of \$100,000 plus in bids is because of the distance for the Phoenix area contractors to travel.

III. Discussion/Possible Action: Fundraising Opportunities and Donation Update.

Ms. Greer reported SFD has received about \$36,000 in donations for the Memorial, to date, and have another \$7,000 in confirmed funds coming in. She said we have received \$1,500 in donations directly from the mail-out thus far.

Several fundraising opportunities are upcoming:

- Wine tasting on June 9th, Vino di Sedona – 4:00 to 7:00 PM, \$35 cover charge for 8 wine tastings and cheese/meat tray. Mr. Soto will have the girder on display and silent auction items available. The project will also receive proceeds from the bottles of wine sold during the event. Mr. Soto said he needs permission from the City for parking. He will do marketing with a Chamber of Commerce email blast, Red Rock News, etc. and Mrs. Tanzer and Mr. Soto will work on a flyer for the event, tickets, and wrist bands. He will need a couple of volunteers to check IDs, etc. Mr. Soto said in the next few weeks, he will get back to planning the rescheduled event at Sound Bites. He has about \$8,000 worth of silent auction items at his house.
- Fundraising at Weber’s IGA in the Village of Oak Creek on May 14th from 8:00 AM to 4:00 PM; Mr. Burke and Mr. Jablow will display the girder and accept donations.
- Fundraising at Canyon Breeze in Uptown on May 28th, which should be a busy day as it is Memorial Day weekend. The girder will be on display in front of Canyon Breeze. SFD Finance is working to get the swiping device for Mr. Jablow’s telephone to accept PayPal donations.
- Mr. Jablow said the Gary Sinise Foundation has committed to donate \$5,000 and we will be receiving \$1,000 grant from the Christ Lutheran Church. Local Architect Bret Maupin committed to \$1,000 and he is trying to get more.
- Mrs. Tanzer contacted the New York Community Bank with a solicitation letter and application with intention to follow-up with the local bank; she is sure they are going to donate, and as they want to be on the donor plaque, it will be at least \$911.
- Mrs. Tanzer also tried to solicit donations from Northern Arizona Healthcare, but has been unsuccessful in contacting their representative; she has a friend who is a Charge Nurse in Cottonwood, and she gave her some solicitation letters to distribute throughout Verde Valley Medical Center; she will follow-up on that progress.
- Mr. Jablow said he had previously applied to APS, but it fell through; he has a new APS contact, and will now follow up to see what happens. He thanked Mr. Burke for getting the Phoenix Division of FDNY Retirees to donate \$1,000.

IV. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 10:40 AM. Ms. Greer will follow-up with LEA (after they talk to DeTar Construction) to determine when the best time will be for the next Committee meeting.

Original signed by Tricia Greer

Tricia Greer, Recorder to the 9/11 Committee